

Econ 347: Economics and Policy of LGBT Issues (F21)

TuTh 1-2:15 Bartlett 131

Prof. M. V. Lee Badgett lbadgett@econs.umass.edu

Office Hours: Tuesdays 11-noon in 319 Crotty and by appointment

Cell phone: 310-904-9761 (Mon-Fri 9 am – 5 pm; or emergencies)

Twitter: @LeeBadgett

Table of Contents (click on heading to go to section)

INTRODUCTION	2
GENERAL INFO	3
EVALUATION	3
GENERAL NOTES ON ASSIGNMENTS	5
GRADE DETERMINATION	5
OTHER IMPORTANT CLASS POLICIES	5
SCHEDULE OF READINGS AND DISCUSSIONS	7
MODULE 1: ECONOMIES AND IDENTITIES	7
Sept. 2: Introductions	7
Sept. 7 & 9: What does this term mean?	7
Sept. 14, 16: How have economies shaped what it means to be LGBT?	7
MODULE 2: EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION IN THE MARKETPLACE	7
Sept 21, 23: Does employment discrimination exist against LGBT people?	8
Sept 28, 30: Using nondiscrimination policies to reduce discrimination	8
Oct 5, 7: Policy vs. Profits: Do they lead to equality?	8
MODULE 3: PUBLIC SECTOR and PUBLIC ACCOMMODATIONS DISCRIMINATION	9
Oct 12 - 21: Public Accommodations in General	9
MODULE 4: FAMILY ECONOMICS	10
Oct 26, 28: Economics of families and the division of labor	10
Nov 2, 4: Economics and Marriage Equality	10
Nov 9, 16: Religious liberty and LGBT rights, revisiting public accommodations	10
MODULE 5: GOING GLOBAL	11
Nov. 18, 23: Identities across borders and economic challenges	11
Nov. 30: Economic Development and LGBT Rights—cause and effect?	11
Dec. 2 & 7: Project Presentations	11

Introduction

The 20th century saw the development of identities and social movements related to sexual orientation and gender identity (SOGI), mainly for lesbian, gay, bisexual, and transgender people (LGBT) people. The 21st century has already seen rapid changes in the economic, social, and legal position of LGBT people, with those changes being positive in many countries, negative in some countries, and still contested in almost all countries. Many of these public debates about LGBT issues—marriage equality, nondiscrimination laws, and the like—have involved questions of morality or religious beliefs. However, these debates and their resolutions are also fundamentally economic issues, shaping and being shaped by the relationship between economic structures and individual lives and identities. This class is rooted in that interplay of economic inequality and economic structures, including market and political relationships.

The social science discipline of economics has only fairly recently incorporated sexual orientation and gender identity into its study of the workplace, families, business outcomes, health, poverty, and economic development. Recent advances in measurement of sexual orientation and gender identity have opened up research possibilities and made possible a rapidly growing body of research in the labor economics field, in particular. To round out the economics literature, this course uses both a social science lens and a policy lens to approach LGBT life—and how sexual orientations and gender identities shape everyone’s life—from an economic perspective.

As a result of new data, economics has contributed insights to many policy discussions about LGBT people, from nondiscrimination laws to military policy to marriage equality. This research has played a role in the development of a sophisticated social movement that has incorporated research into litigation, legislative advocacy, and public education. The course will include examples of how research is being used in current policy debates. Readings include social science research from economics, history, sociology, and political science (both from the U.S. and globally), as well as court decisions and legislation. We will have guest speakers talking about the real-world implications of these topics.

Core cross-cutting questions for the course include:

- How have economic, political, and social changes shaped SOGI identities?
- What’s the role of LGBT social movements in shaping policy and economic outcomes?
- Why do SOGI-related inequalities exist? How can we best identify and measure SOGI-related inequalities?
- Can economic reasoning and economic forces reduce anti-gay prejudice?
- Are LGBT families different from other families? Why and how? Implications?
- How do public policies shape economic inequality for LGBT people?

General learning goals and strategies for the course:

- To understand how and why sexual orientation and gender identity shape and are shaped by economic outcomes and well-being
 - Reading historical and empirical studies

- Engagement with classmates in discussions and Perusall
- To see how social science (especially economic) research is used in the context of policy debates and social movement activism to shape policy
 - Practice interpreting findings from research studies
 - Interaction with guest speakers
 - Readings related to legislation and litigation
 - Writing evidence-based op-eds
- To enhance skills of careful and critical reading of research-related articles and books from economics and other disciplines
 - To interpret and summarize key findings in research studies
 - Engagement with readings through Perusall
 - Class discussions
- To express ideas and opinions in well-written, well-reasoned forms
 - To summarize key points from our discussions and readings and compose tweets
 - To write an op-ed that supports a position in a policy debate with economic research and reasoning
 - Write a research paper on a topic of your own choosing

General Info

Course meetings: We are scheduled to meet in person this semester. If something happens, though, we will be nimble and will adapt.

Course readings: All readings listed below (with exceptions noted on Moodle) must be accessed through the Perusall tool through links on the course Moodle site. Information on Perusall will be posted on Moodle and discussed in class.

Recommended refresher (or introduction): We will be reading some articles that use statistics. If you haven't taken statistics ever or recently, you might want to watch a couple of good videos that describe regression analysis before Sept. 21. Start here:
https://www.youtube.com/watch?annotation_id=annotation_3961221783&feature=iv&src_vid=k_OB1tWX9PM&v=38iNlkzF1sE

Evaluation

We will have a variety of assignments in this course to encourage you to think about what we're discussing more fully and to give you experience producing high quality written material in several genres. Overall, there are 100 points available (before any extra credit).

10 points **Reading engagement:** We will be using a new platform for readings—Perusall. It's an exciting tool designed to increase your engagement with the reading and with each other. You must access each reading through its link in Moodle, which will take you to the Perusall platform. The first time you go there, you'll be asked to enter your student ID number so it can track your reading progress. From there, the idea is that you will annotate each (and every!)

reading with questions and comments. You'll see your classmates' comments and might want to "upvote" or respond to them. They'll comment on your comments, and you can respond. The platform's algorithm will assign you a grade based on the quality and quantity of your engagement. We'll talk more about Perusall in class.

20 points (4 points each) **Weekly tweets:** This assignment applies to nine weeks of the course but you are only required to do the assignment 5 of the 9 assigned weeks (weeks 2-13). You will write and turn in on Moodle a paragraph describing the most interesting or important thing you learned in the class that week that you would like to share with the world. Then you will turn that key point into 2 or 3 tweets (280 character maximum) and you will tweet them with a course hashtag, #LGBTecon2021. *Please sign up for a twitter account if you don't already have one and follow me: @LeeBadgett.*

15 points **Op-ed assignment, due Oct. 12:** You will write an 800-word op-ed, an essay that makes an argument in a journalistic way. The topic will be whether Congress should pass the Equality Act. More details will be given in class about how to write an op-ed.

15 points **Debate flow chart assignment, due Nov. 18.** In this assignment, you will chart out the arguments and counter-arguments related to religious exemptions from nondiscrimination laws. More details and a method will be offered in class.

40 points **Final project, due Dec. 10:** You will undertake a research-based project that addresses a topic related to the course content, and you will present your findings in class on either Dec. 2 or 7. You can write a 10-12 double-spaced paper or, with my prior approval, you may use another format, such as a video presentation. Topics and formats must be cleared with me. There will be more information in class, and there will be intermediate deadlines for choosing a topic (due Oct. 15) and providing an annotated bibliography (due Nov. 5).

Attendance grade: As a basic matter, I expect each student to attend class and to participate fully in group projects. If you need to miss a class for one of the good reasons related to the University's rules, including the pandemic (your health or your family's health needs), religious observance, unavoidable work scheduling, or other extenuating circumstances, I expect you to let me know why you missed the class. However, each unexcused absence will result in one point deducted from the grade total.

Extra credit: You can get up to 10 points in extra credit:

1. Attend events (2-4 points each): From time to time I might suggest that you attend an event (online or in person) and do a set of tweets on key takeaways from the event. You can do this extra assignment up to two times.
2. You can bring a "weekly treat" to class (4 points): find a short article, news clip, or other that addresses a topic we're discussing that week. You'll post it for others to read and will write about 200 words on what your "treat" adds to our knowledge of that week's topic. You can only do this extra assignment once.
3. Meet with me during office hours at least once during the semester (1 point).

General notes on assignments

- *Deadlines:* You will turn all assignments in on Moodle. Assignments turned in late without my permission will have points deducted from the grade. Assignments more than 2 weeks late will not be accepted without prior approval.
- *Formatting:* All papers for this class should use a normal (not bolded or italicized) 12-point font, one-inch margins all around, and double-spaced formatting. Assignments that do not meet these requirements will not be accepted. Please turn in your assignment as a Microsoft Word document (or a document readable in Word). Please **DO NOT** turn in PDFs.
- *Preferred citation style:* You must use a consistent reference style for any materials you reference, including information from websites. I prefer that you use the Chicago style with an author-date reference in the text (Author, date), and a reference list at the end of the paper: http://www.chicagomanualofstyle.org/tools_citationguide.html.

Grade determination

Letter grade	Grade range
A	100-85
A-	80-84
B+	75-80
B	70-74
B-	65-69
C+	60-64
C	55-59
C-	50-54
D	45-49
F	<45

Other important class policies

- *Preferred Gender Pronoun and Name:* Class rosters are provided to instructors with the student's legal name (although you can now put in your preferred pronouns). Please let me know if you use a different name. In our introductions at the beginning of the semester, each of us will tell the others their preferred gender pronouns.

- *Disability Accommodations:* The University of Massachusetts Amherst is committed to making reasonable, effective and appropriate accommodations to meet the needs of students with disabilities and help create a barrier-free campus. If you have a disability and require accommodations, please register with Disability Services to have an accommodation letter sent to your faculty. Information on services and materials for registering are also available on the [University of Massachusetts Amherst Disability Services page](#).
- *Academic Honesty:* Academic dishonesty is prohibited in all programs of the University. Academic dishonesty includes but is not limited to cheating, fabrication, plagiarism, and facilitating dishonesty. Appropriate sanctions may be imposed on any student who has committed an act of academic dishonesty. Since students are expected to be familiar with this policy and the commonly accepted standards of academic integrity, ignorance of such standards is not normally sufficient evidence of lack of intent. I will use Turnitin and will report cases of academic dishonesty. Please read the [University of Massachusetts Amherst Academic Honesty Policy](#).
- *Other resources:* The UMass Writing Center can provide consultations for writing assignments:
<http://www.umass.edu/writingprogram/writingcenter? ga=2.269196786.209561750.6.1597673063-117513784.1426453458>

Schedule of readings and discussions

MODULE 1: ECONOMIES AND IDENTITIES

Sept. 2: Introductions

Sept. 7 & 9: What does this term mean?

Laumann, Edward O. et al. 1995. *The Social Organization of Sexuality: Sexual Practices in the United States*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, Ch. 8: "Homosexuality," pp. 283-301.

Susan Stryker, "An Introduction to Transgender Terms and Concepts," *Transgender History*, Seal Press, 2008; 1-29.

Sept. 14, 16: How have economies shaped what it means to be LGBT?

John D'Emilio, "Capitalism and Gay Identity" originally published in *Powers of Desire*, In *Powers of Desire: The Politics of Sexuality*, eds. Ann Snitow, Christine Stansell, and Sharon Thompson. New York: Monthly Review Press.

Optional: Here's a recent interview with D'Emilio in which he looks back on this essay and connects it with current issues: <https://www.jacobinmag.com/2020/08/gay-identity-capitalism-lgbt>

Jen Manion, "Introduction: Extraordinary Lives," *Female Husbands: A Trans History*, Cambridge University Press, 2020.

Richard Posner, *Sex and Reason*, excerpt from Ch. 5: Sex and Rationality pp. 111-128.
Note: You'll see my comments on Posner in Perusall.

Jenna Wortham, "On Instagram, Seeing Between the Gender Lines", *The New York Times Magazine*, 11/16/18 <https://www.nytimes.com/interactive/2018/11/16/magazine/tech-design-instagram-gender.html>

MODULE 2: EMPLOYMENT DISCRIMINATION IN THE MARKETPLACE

Sept 21, 23: Does employment discrimination exist against LGBT people?

(Tues) Experiments:

Video on Economic Theories of Discrimination (11 minutes)

Doris Weichselbaumer, "Sexual Orientation Discrimination in Hiring," *Labour Economics*, Vol. [10, Issue 6](#), December 2003, pp. 629-642.

See also video "Reading Weichselbaumer Together" to walk through this study (10 min)

András Tilcsik, "Pride and Prejudice: Employment Discrimination against Openly Gay Men in the United States," *American Journal of Sociology*, Vol. 117, No. 2 (September), 2011, [FOCUS on pp. 586-607 for this week.](#)

Pedulla, David S. "The positive consequences of negative stereotypes: Race, sexual orientation, and the job application process." *Social Psychology Quarterly* 77, no. 1 (2014): 75-94.

"Transgender Need Not Apply: A Report on Transgender Employment Discrimination," Make the Road New York, March 2010,
http://www.maketheroad.org/pix_reports/TransNeedNotApplyReport_05.10.pdf

(Thurs) Economic gaps—income and poverty

Badgett, Carpenter, and Sansone, "LGBTQ Economics," *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 35, No. 2, 2021. [Pp. 158-164.](#)

Badgett, M. V., Soon Kyu Choi, and Bianca DM Wilson. "LGBT poverty in the United States: A study of differences between sexual orientation and gender identity groups." (2019)

Sept 28, 30: Using nondiscrimination policies to reduce discrimination

Guest speaker (9/30): Commissioner Jocelyn Samuels, U.S. Equal Employment Opportunity Commission

Video on discrimination law (from 2020, so mentions a different guest speaker)

H.R. 5: The Equality Act 2021

US Supreme Court, *Bostock v. Clayton County GA*. Gorsuch opinion; Alito dissent.

Oct 5, 7: Policy vs. Profits: Do they lead to equality?

Revisit Tilcsik article, focus on pp. 607-621.

Marieka Klawitter, "Multilevel Analysis of the Effects of Antidiscrimination Policies on Earnings by Sexual Orientation," *Journal of Policy Analysis and Management*, Vol. 30, No. 2, 334–358 (2011).

M. V. Lee Badgett, "Making the business case for LGBT equality", from *The Economic Case for LGBT Equality: Why Fair and Equal Treatment Benefits Us All*, Beacon Press, 2020.

Gao, Huasheng, and Wei Zhang. "Employment Nondiscrimination Acts and Corporate Innovation." *Management Science*, 2016.

MODULE 3: PUBLIC ACCOMMODATIONS DISCRIMINATION

Oct 12 - 21: Public Accommodations in General

Guest Speaker, 10/19: Prof. Jennifer Levi, Western New England University School of Law; GLAD's Transgender Rights Project Director

Reisner, Sari L., Jaclyn M. White Hughto, Emilia E. Dunham, Katherine J. Heflin, Jesse Blue Glass Begenyi, Julia Coffey-Esquivel, and Sean Cahill. "Legal protections in public accommodations settings: A critical public health issue for transgender and gender-nonconforming people." *The Milbank Quarterly* 93, no. 3 (2015): 484-515.

Boston Globe, "The Argument: Should the state ban discrimination against transgender people in public places?" March 13, 2016.

Bathrooms:

Hasenbush, Amira, Andrew R. Flores, and Jody L. Herman. "Gender Identity Nondiscrimination Laws in Public Accommodations: A Review of Evidence Regarding Safety and Privacy in Public Restrooms, Locker Rooms, and Changing Rooms." *Sexuality Research and Social Policy* (2018): 1-14.

Herman, Jody L. "Gendered restrooms and minority stress: The public regulation of gender and its impact on transgender people's lives." *Journal of Public Management & Social Policy* 19, no. 1 (2013).

"How Much Does a Gender Neutral Bathroom Cost?" ToiletPartitions.com, <https://accessories.toiletpartitions.com/category/all-gender-restrooms/>, April 30, 2020.

"How AP tallied the Cost of North Carolina's Bathroom Bill," March 27, 2017.

Identification:

Dean Spade, "Administering Gender," in *Normal Life: Administrative Violence, Critical Trans Politics, & the Limits of Law*, Duke University Press, 2015, pp. 73-93.

"An Act Relative to Gender Identity on Massachusetts Identification," 2021

<https://malegislature.gov/Bills/192/S2282>

MODULE 4: FAMILY ECONOMICS

Oct 26, 28: Economics of families and the division of labor

M. V. Lee Badgett, Ch 6: "A Family Resemblance," *Money, Myths, and Change: The Economic Lives of Lesbians and Gay Men*, Univ of Chicago Press, 2001.

Badgett, Carpenter, and Sansone, "LGBTQ Economics," *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 35, No. 2, 2021. Pp. 151-156.

Nov 2, 4: Economics and Marriage Equality

M. V. Lee Badgett, "The Economic Value of Marriage for Same-sex Couples," *Drake Law Review*, Vol. 58, 2009-2010. Read intro and pp 1100-1116. See also dialog with Douglas Allen at the end of the pdf.

Douglas Allen, "Who Should be Allowed into the Marriage Franchise?" *Drake Law Review*, Vol. 58, 2009-2010. Read pp., 1043-1047, 1063-1073.

Excerpts from Nancy Polikoff, from *Beyond (Straight and Gay) Marriage*, Beacon Press, 2009.

Badgett, Carpenter, and Sansone, "LGBTQ Economics," *Journal of Economic Perspectives*, Vol. 35, No. 2, 2021. Pp. 156-158.

Nov 9, 16: Religious liberty and LGBT rights, revisiting public accommodations

Masterpiece Cakeshop, LTD., et al. v. Colorado Civil Rights Commission, 2018, (Kennedy majority opinion and Ginsburg dissent)

Gov. Michael O. Leavitt, "Shared Spaces and Brave Gambles," in *Religious Freedom, LGBT Rights, and the Prospects for Common Ground*, ed. By Williams N. Eskridge, Jr., and Robin Fretwell Wilson, pp. 460-476.

Chai Feldblum, "What I Really Believe About Religious Liberty and LGBT Rights," Medium, Aug. 1, 2018, <https://medium.com/@chaifeldblum/what-i-really-believe-about-religious-liberty-and-lgbt-rights-2cc64ade95a2>.

For 11/16: Amicus (friend-of-the-court) briefs to be assigned to groups.

MODULE 5: GOING GLOBAL

Nov. 18, 23: Identities across borders and economic challenges

Dennis Altman, Chapter 6: "The Globalization of Sexual Identities," *Global Sex*, University of Chicago Press, 2001. Pp. 86 – 105.

Mark Gevisser, *The Pink Line*, FSG, 2020. Pp. 3-41, "Prologue: A Debt to Love," and "The World's Pink Lines."

Parmesh Shahani, "Jugaad Resistance," *Queeristan: LGBTQ Inclusion in the Indian Workplace*, 2020.17-33.

The Economist: "How the Internet Is Changing the Experience of Coming Out", Aug. 8, 2020.

Nov. 30: Economic Development and LGBT Rights—cause and effect?

Guest Speaker: Javier Corrales, Amherst College

M. V. Lee Badgett, Ch. 5: "The Cost to Economies: Adding It Up," *The Economic Case for LGBT Equality*, Beacon Press, 2020. 107-133.

Ronald F. Inglehart, "Changing Values Among Western Publics from 1970s to 2006," *West European Politics*, Vol. 31, Nos. 1-2, 2008, pp. 130-132 and 142-144.

Javier Corrales, "The Expansion of LGBT Rights in Latin America...and the Backlash," for *Oxford Handbook of Global LGBT and Sexual Diversity Politics*, July 2018.

Dec. 2 & 7: Project Presentations