The Mencius 1 Interpolations  
Working Version of 4 Dec 2013, for discussion at WSWG 26  
E Bruce and A Taeko Brooks

1A3 1B1 1B10  
[KEY GENUINE]

0303 Death of Mencius, and probably of Lû Pîng-gûng

1 0303 Written as a valediction to the career of Mencius; perhaps based on a real abortive contact

2 1B3a 1B5 1B7 CONSTRUCTIVE

These at first directly followed 1B1 in a continuous series

3 1A2 > 1B2 1B4a EXTENSION, < 1B1

4 1A7a 王者 TRANSFORMS 2A2a

Layers 1-4 are all in the form of complete interviews

5 2A3-2B1 Restatement of the above doctrines as direct Mencius statements (孟子曰) SYSTEMATIC

Note that 2A5 王者 derives from 1B7, whereas 2A6 逡 範 develops the incompatible 1A7

Layer 5 is a new departure: complete Mc statements rather than complete interviews

6 1A3:4 > 1A7b [hostile interp in 1A7] ECON; TEACH PEOPLE

7 1B4b 王者.

8 1B3b “weakness”

Layers 6-8 are also a new format: addenda to previous interviews, whether genuine or spurious

9 0300 2A1 recommends 2A3-2B1 (layer 5) to Chí Mîn-wâng

0299 DDJ 47 challenges LY mode of knowledge

0300 Interpolations in LY 14 and 15 reject meditation, creating a crisis for the Mencians

10 0299 2A2b The Yên Ywæn Question MEDITATION CRISIS

11 2B2-2B12: protocol reasons for Mc departure from Chí 1B11 IMAGE REWORKING

1B11 denies Mencian responsibility for the Yên fiasco; 2B2 take up that thread

1B11 APOLOGIA

0286 Chí invades Sûng

1A3:5 > 1A4 ACCUSATORY

These are so compatible that it has been suggested that they are one continuous passage

12 0290 2B13: intentional envoi for chapter, compare 1B16 ENVOI

0285 Chí expelled from Sûng: disgust with all rulers (compare DDJ for same period)

1B6 1B8 HOSTILE

These were placed discontinuously, by mere verbal links with the preceding 1B5 and 1B7

13 0284 2B14: “never intended to stay long in Chí”

This dismissive statement dissociates Mencius altogether from the doings of Chí

It was some time before the southern Mencians sought to renew the argument, leading to MC 3

Comment: In the circle around Mencius at the time of his death, probably in Týng (the location of Mencius’ last patronage) there were obviously persons of very differing views about statecraft and associated issues. In the next few years, all had a hand in supplementing the original Mencius transcripts in such a way as to facilitate their own view of what the Mencius philosophy was, or should have been. Thus, the writer of 1A7a would never have agreed to the addition of the incompatible 1A7b; that addition can only have been done by someone else, and at a later time. This chart attempts to allow for such relationships.

Disharmony within the Mencian circle led to an attempt to formulate, de novo, a statement of Mencianism that would include all major views, and thus placate all competing opinions. This led to the eight passages 2B3-2B1 (everything from 2B2 on is on a different subject, and in a different format). This ironic construction did not however succeed in bringing all parties together, and the end result was the split which took some Mencians out of the original circle, and led to the formation of the northern school, probably in Mencius’ native Dzôu, where many passages portray him as teaching and receiving visitors.