Facilitators, barriers, and components of a culturally-tailored afterschool physical activity program in preadolescent African-American girls and their mothers

Sofiya Alhassan, PhD,
Department of Kinesiology, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA

Cory Greever, MS,
Department of Kinesiology, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA

Ogechi Nwaokelemeh, MS,
Department of Kinesiology, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA

Albert Mendoza, MS,
Department of Kinesiology, University of Massachusetts Amherst, Amherst, MA

Daheia J. Barr-Anderson, MSPH, PhD
Department of Epidemiology and Biostatistics, University of South Carolina, Columbia, SC

Abstract

Objectives—Traditional physical activity (PA) programs have not been effective in increasing PA in African-American girls. Currently, there is limited information regarding the components of PA programs that drive participation in African-American girls. The purpose of this investigation was to describe the facilitators, barriers, and components of a culturally-tailored afterschool PA program that will potentially inspire the participation of African-American mother-daughter dyads.

Methods—Six focus groups (n=12 mother-daughter dyads; daughters, 7–10 yrs in age) were conducted between March and May 2012. Focus group semi-structured interviews were transcribed, coded, and systematically analyzed using NVivo.

Results—Mothers reported a preference for non-traditional (dancing, household chores) types of PA. While daughters preferred to participate in both dance-based and traditional types (walking, riding bikes) of PA. Participants felt that the use of a culturally-tailored dance program would be appealing because it highlights the cultural and historical legacy of the African-American culture. Mothers wanted programs that would allow them time to spend with their daughters. Top three dance styles that mothers wanted to participate in were African, Hip-hop, and Salsa/samba. While, daughters reported that they would enjoy participating in Hip-hop, African, and Jazz. The most common responses given for resources needed for participating in a culturally-tailored afterschool dance program were the location of the program, transportation, and childcare for siblings.

Corresponding Author: Sofiya Alhassan, Ph.D. Assistant Professor, University of Massachusetts, Department of Kinesiology, 110 Totman Building, 30 Eastman Lane, Amherst, MA 01003-9258, Phone: 1 - 413-545-3475, Fax: 1- 413-545-2906, alhassan@kin.umass.edu.

Authors’ contributions
SA conceived study and acquired funding. SA, ON, and AM participated in data acquisition. SA, CG, and DA conducted the data analyses. All authors participated in data interpretation and were directly involved in drafting and edition of the manuscript. All authors have read and approved the final manuscript.
**Conclusions**—The present investigation highlights some cultural factors related to facilitators and barriers of PA that should be addressed in designing PA studies for African-American girls and their mothers.

**Keywords**
African-American mother-daughter dyads; physical activity; qualitative study

**Introduction**

Current physical activity (PA) guidelines recommend that school-aged children (>5 years) should engage in ≥60 minutes of daily moderate-to-vigorous PA (MVPA). Based on objective assessment of PA, approximately 42% and 8% of 6–11 and 12–15 year old youth, respectively, met current PA recommendation. As age increases, reported minutes/day of PA decreases. This is an alarming trend since PA levels have been shown to track from childhood into adulthood. Additionally, African-American girls are more likely to report not participating in any form of PA over the past seven days. The low prevalence of PA in African-American girls and women has been associated with a higher prevalence of obesity and diabetes risk factors, illustrating the critical need to develop effective strategies to improve PA levels in this population.

Traditional PA programs (e.g., walking, afterschool sport programs) have not been effective in increasing PA in minority children. For PA interventions to be successful among minority children, they must enjoy participating in the program’s activities. Currently, there is limited information regarding components of PA programs that drive participation in minority children. In recent years, a large number of culturally-tailored interventions have been designed to increase PA among minority girls. However, there is a little insight on what makes these types of programs more attractive than traditional PA programs. In African-American girls, researchers have examined culturally-tailored PA interventions, such as afro-centric dance, and found no significant change in PA levels. The static PA levels could be explained by a lack of parental participation.

In the African-American culture, parental (particularly maternal) health behaviors strongly influence children’s health behaviors, highlighting the critical need for studies exploring methods to enhance both parental and child health behaviors. Barr-Anderson et al. found in their review of PA interventions with a family component targeting African-American adolescent girls that the incorporation of key family members (primarily mothers) show promise in increasing PA in African-American girls. Therefore, it is possible that the parent-child relationship could moderate the effectiveness of a behavioral intervention. In order to develop such an intervention, critical information is needed regarding the structural and contextual components of a PA program that would interest African-American girls and their mothers.

Interventions that aim to change contextual aspects of a child’s life may be more effective than individually targeted interventions. In previous focus group studies, parents (mostly Caucasian) indicated that barriers for adhering to PA programs for their children include weather, siblings, time, neighborhood safety, and lack of affordable and accessible recreation facilities. Very little is known about African-American girls’ and women’s interests, motivations or challenges in participating in an afterschool program. In addition, there is no information on the potential characteristics of PA interventions that will enhance the participation and retention of African-American girls and their mothers. The primary objective of this investigation was to describe the facilitators, barriers and components of a
culturally-tailored afterschool dance program that will potentially inspire the participation of African-American girls and their mothers.

Methods

Participants

Participants were recruited from afterschool programs within the greater Springfield, MA area. Participants were eligible for the study if the parent self-identify the daughter as African-American/Black and was between the ages of 7 – 10 years of age on the date of the focus group meeting. Mother was defined as the primary female role-model who resides with the girl. Due to the formative nature of the study, there was no age restriction for mothers. A total of 16 dyads responded to the study advertisement and were scheduled to participate in the focus group meetings. Four dyads did not show up for the scheduled meetings, for a final participant sample of 12 dyads, who were separated into six (daughters, n=3; mothers, n=3) focus group meetings. Mothers and daughters provided informed consent and assent, respectively, to participate in this study. University institutional review board approved the study.

Focus Group Meetings Procedure

Focus group meetings were held in March through May of 2012. Demographics and socioeconomic status were determined using a structured questionnaire. Participants standing height and body weight were measured twice to the nearest millimeter (direct reading stadiometer) and to the nearest 0.13kg (digital scale), respectively. Participants’ waist circumference was measured intersecting the umbilicus using a Gulick tape. Girl’s and mother’s PA level were assessed with the Physical Activity Questionnaire (PAQ-C) and the short format of the International PA Questionnaire (IPAQ-SF), respectively. The PAQ-C (10 questions) was developed to assess general levels of PA in children. In 8 – 16 year old elementary school age children of diverse background, PAQ-C has been shown to provide reliable \((r > 0.70)\) and valid \(r = 0.39;\) Caltrac accelerometer) measures of PA.\textsuperscript{19,20} IPAQ-SF was designed to assess adherence to national PA guidelines during the previous 7 days.\textsuperscript{21} IPAQ-SF (9 questions) examines time spent walking, vigorous PA, moderate PA and sedentary PA.\textsuperscript{21} IPAQ-SF has been shown to have a reliability of approximately 0.65 in a diverse sample of 1974 adults across 12 countries. Compared to Actigraph accelerometers, IPAQ-SF has a validity of 0.30 \((n=781; 95\% CI 0.23 – 0.36).\)

Following the assessment protocol, dyads were separated into individual groups (separate for mothers and daughters) in order to minimize biased responses. Within each group, semi-structured questions were used to ensure consistency across group meetings while allowing participants to provide their unique opinions and attitudes towards PA. The questions were probing in nature in order to inform the development of a culturally relevant intervention. Two researchers moderated each focus group meeting.

Statistical Analyses

All focus group sessions were audio-taped and transcribed verbatim by two researchers. A third member of the research staff then reviewed transcripts for accuracy. Transcripts were thematically analyzed using a three-stage process.\textsuperscript{22} The first step involved importing text into NVivo (Version 10, QSR, Southport, UK). The transcripts were read and coded by two pairs of researchers (separate pairs for mothers and daughters). Marked codes were then extracted as free nodes into a new database. Second, an additional set of researchers reviewed all transcripts. If any differences were observed, a third researcher settled differences between the two coders and a consensus were reached. Third, codes were then ranked, summarized and used to develop thematic codes and definitions (Table 1).
**Results**

All the participants self-identified themselves and their daughter(s) as either African-American or Black. On average, the mothers had a BMI of 32.9 ± 6.2 kg/m$^2$ with a waist circumference of 108.5 ± 22.4 inches and the daughters (age = 9 ± 1.4 years) had an age- and sex-adjusted BMI percentile of 78.9 ± 29.3. The mothers engaged in 176.7 ± 99.4 minutes per week of MVPA. The girls had a PAQ-C composite score of 2.4 ± 0.5 (with 1 indicating low PA level and 5 indicating high PA levels). The PA data for the mothers’ and daughters indicate that they were both moderately active. Three themes emerged from the focus group meetings. The results below provide the information obtained for each of the emerging themes.

**Constructs of general physical activity**

Participants were asked to indicate what came to mind when they thought of PA. Most mothers (n=7) stated that when thinking about PA, they think of something that made them feel good, something fun and enjoyable. Mothers made comments such as, “Something that is fun and would make me feel good.” and “Movement, energy, something that will make me feel good.” Additionally, PA gave them a feeling of accomplishment. For example, “I do like to challenge myself from time to time and I’m always surprised by what I can do”. A couple of negative comments were made in regards to PA connotation. One mother stated, “Just the term physical activity makes me tired. But I know that it’s not a tiring task, but just the way it’s worded.” Another mother stated, “When I think of physical activity I think of work. That you have to put forth a lot of effort.” The most predominately negative perception of PA among mothers (n=10) was related to the monetary expense of hair care and maintenance. Daughters (n=12) indicated that when they thought of PA, they generally thought of something fun and made comments such as, “Something that is fun and would make me feel good. I also think it would give me good exercise.”

**Types and support for PA**

The types of PA that mothers enjoyed were categorized as either non-traditional or traditional. The majority of mothers (n=9) seemed to prefer non-traditional (i.e., dancing or household chores) forms of activity. Mothers made comments such as, “The ones that I really like doing: dancing, listening to music and dancing with my children,” or “cleaning while listening to music.” Even when they mentioned that they preferred participating in more traditional types (i.e., structured exercise class, sports, walking) of PA, examples favored structured PA that involved dancing. One mother reported, “I do like the exercise classes that involve dancing like Zumba or any other type of organized, dance-type, exercise classes.” Similar to mothers, daughters (n=11) reported a preference to participate in either dance-based or traditional types (i.e., walking, riding bikes) of PA.

Mothers were asked if they thought that their social support for their child’s PA had an impact on the child’s PA level. All participating mothers said they sought opportunities to participate in activities with their daughter: “If she sees me doing it, she generally wants to try it. She might not stick with it, but at least I know it’s something that she’s got some interest in and we can tweak it so she can be more interested in it as she sees me doing it.” When the same question was asked to daughters, the majority of them felt that their mothers’ support influenced their ability to be physically active. They also thought that seeing their mother being physically activity influenced whether or not they wanted to be physically active.
Components of culturally-tailored intervention

The second portion of the focus group meeting centered on the use of culturally-tailored dance program to improve PA levels. Mothers (n=12) felt that a culturally-tailored dance program would be appealing because they wanted to try something new with their daughter, and such a program would highlight cultural and historical legacy of African-American culture. One mother stated, “It’s physical and also incorporates heritage. My daughter’s at an age where I’m trying to teach her about who she is and to be proud of that, so I think that we can incorporate physical aspect into who she is as a young African female.” Similarly, daughters stated, “It’s a way you can express yourself. Also, because I love the African culture.” All mothers indicated that they wanted to find programs that would allow them time to spend with their daughters. As one mother stated, “I want to spend more time with my daughter doing physical activity. It would be a great time to bond. We will have fun together doing something positive.” Others indicated that it would be a good bonding experience. “Doing an afterschool dance program is not just a new activity. It’s not your typical, sign up for soccer; you drop off and pick up your child. It’s something more creative, a different kind of idea that seems like it would be a good way to fill the day.” All girls reported that they wanted to participate in a culturally-tailored afterschool dance program because they wanted to spend time with their mothers. When asked what types of dance programs they wanted to participate in, the top three styles mentioned by mothers were African (n=12), Hip-hop (n=12), and Salsa/samba (n=7). The daughters reported that they would most enjoy Hip-hop (n=12), African (n=10), and Jazz (n=8).

Participants were asked what would prevent them from participating in a culturally-tailored dance program. For mothers, the overriding concern was scheduling and time conflicts: “I tend to have issues with afterschool things during the week because I go to school two evenings a week for now. So sometimes it’s either, I have school on the days that there are afterschool things held, or I have school work, or I’m very tired, or there are issues with supper, who’s going to cook supper, or what are we going eat, and I don’t know, sometimes I don’t get to do things with her that I would like to have her do with regards to physical activity because of that.” Contrary, daughters did not feel that there were any factors that could prevent them from participating. Mothers were asked to list resources that would make it easier for them to participate in a culturally-tailored afterschool dance program. The most common responses were location of the program, transportation to and from the program, and childcare for siblings during the program such as: “Finding activities that are convenient, affordable, interesting, that combination is hard. You might find the schedule, oh I can’t afford that, or I don’t have the time for that. So everything that fits the convenience of it, the interest of it, the affordability of it, that’s what has to work.” and “I may need childcare on some occasions.”

Discussion

Since 2007, a total of 22 afterschool/community-based studies have examined the impact of PA in children and youth. Of these studies, 10 focused on African-American children.14.23–31 The majority of the studies reported little to no significant impact on altering PA levels. In minority children, researchers have indicated that cultural factors need to be considered when designing effective PA studies.9,32–34 However, the cultural components that should be targeted in PA interventions that involve both the child and the mother are currently lacking within the scientific literature.

In conducting these focus groups, we first investigated the participants’ general perception of PA. Overall, the girls in this study had positive perceptions of PA, particularly PA that involved dancing, compared to traditional PA pursuits. In 2006, Grieser et al. examined PA attitudes, preferences, and practices of girls and reported that girls reported activities such as
basketball and running as their favorite activities. However, in a subgroup racial analysis, the researchers reported that the African-American participants listed dancing as their favorite activity. On the other hand, mothers in the present study seemed to gravitate toward non-traditional PA pursuits such as activities of daily living and activities that involved music. Their affinity towards non-traditional PA could stem from their negative attitudes towards traditional PA. Instead, they valued PA that they acquired during the course of doing household chores. In the current study, several of the women commented that they liked to dance in their home to music while doing household chores. Although participants had a positive perception of PA, some negative connotations associated with PA were highlighted. Similar to previous findings in African-American women, some mothers associated the phrase “physical activity” with boring, tiring, and uncomfortable.

In the present investigation, the mothers’ negative connotations regarding PA were not share by the daughters. It is possible that differences in this viewpoint by the mothers and daughters could potentially impact PA intervention development and adoption. In addition, mothers agreed that they limited their PA pursuits on days following a visit to the hairdresser. This trend has been observed in African-American women and girls, indicating that hair care is a consistent PA barrier in this population.

In general, children’s perception of activity enjoyment has been correlated to their willingness to participate in the activity. In this study, participants viewed dance as a fun activity that they would enjoy participating in afterschool. While other researchers have indicated that perceived competence seem to be correlated to PA participation, this relationship did not hold true for either the girls or mothers in this study. Both girls and mothers did not believe that their inability to do or learn any dance styles/moves would impact their willingness to participate in a dance study. However, participants stated that their enjoyment of the dance styles would significantly impact their interest in the program.

From this formative research, we learned that African-American girls wanted a dance program that focused on jazz, hip-hop, and African style dancing with up-beat music. It is possible that this program would be engaging for African-American girls and their mothers. In a 2011 study by Jago et al., researchers reported that music (up-tempo, current music) and style of dance (modern/urban forms) have an impact on girls’ willingness to attend afterschool PA sessions. In the present study, the girls also wanted a program that involved their mother. Several of the girls reported that their mother’s perception and involvement in PA has an impact on their interest in participating in a dance program.

When mothers were asked what they looked for in a program, they indicated that they wanted something enjoyable to do with their daughter(s). They sought programs that could enhance their daughter’s cultural heritage, academic performance (i.e., homework tutoring), and overall health, rather than solely emphasizing weight issues. Mothers also wanted their daughters to be exposed to positive mentors that look like them. Consistent with observed attitudes in the existing literature, mothers reported that resources that they would need to reduce their attrition are childcare, snacks/meals, and transportation. Due to the lack of time to prepare dinner for their family, the mothers indicated that they would be resistant to participate in a program that ended after 6:30 pm.

This study has several strengths, primarily that it provides information about African-American mother-daughter dyad perception of PA and the components needed to engage them in a culturally-tailored PA program. Based on the findings from this focus group study, we have designed an intervention that has the following components: 1) culturally-tailored dance program that focuses on hip-hop, jazz, and African; 2) African-American cultural heritage lesson plans; 3) weekly newsletters that focus on overall health; 4) homework tutoring; 5) healthy snacks and family meals, and 6) mentoring with African-American
dance instructors. Some limitations include the lack of direct measures of PA and the small, convenient sample size. Despite these limitations, the findings provide insightful qualitative information that can help researchers better design effective PA interventions in African-American mother-daughter dyads.

Conclusion

In minority children, particularly African-American girls, cultural factors need to be considered when designing effective PA studies.\textsuperscript{9,32–34} The present investigation highlights some of the cultural factors that should be addressed in designing studies for African-American girls and their mothers. In designing effective interventions, researchers need to be cognizant of the needs of the girls and their primary caregiver. The findings from the present focus group study present information that can be used to design effective PA interventions in minority preadolescent girls and their mothers, who are at an increased risk of reduced PA.

Acknowledgments

This study was funded by National Institutes of Diabetes and Digestive and Kidney Diseases (K01 DK087812-01A1). We thank the mother-daughter dyads and Pediatric Physical Activity Lab staff who made this study possible. We also thank Hannah Stoops and Sanyog Shitole for their help with data collection. Authors have no financial disclosures or conflict of interest to report.

References


Ethn Dis. Author manuscript; available in PMC 2014 March 15.
Table 1

Focus group thematic definitions and results on facilitators and barriers of physical activity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Results</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| Constructs of general PA                   | Attitudes towards overall PA. These could be facilitators/barriers regarding participation in PA, or mother’s/daughter’s perception of family’s PA. | Mothers: Positive attitudes of PA – fun, something that makes you feel good  
Daughters: Positive attitude of PA – fun | Mothers: Positive attitude of PA – fun  
Daughters: Negative attitude of PA – none stated |
| Types and support of PA                    | Specific activities that were identified by the dyads in response to questions regarding types of PA. Perception of PA support and its impact on PA participation. | Mothers: Preferred non-traditional activities (dancing, household chores)  
Daughters: Realize that their behavior influences daughters’ PA level and preference | Mothers: Preferred dance-based PA, walking, riding bikes  
Daughters: Felt that mothers PA influenced their choice to be physically active |
| Components of culturally-tailored interventions | Components of a dance program that would either promote or deter participation. Motivation for dyads participation in a culturally-tailored dance program and resources needed to limit attrition. | Mothers: Top 3 dance styles – African, Hip-hop, and Salsa/samba  
Motivation for participation – want daughters to learn about African-American heritage, bonding time with daughter(s)  
Barriers – scheduling or time conflicts, childcare needs  
Resources needed – convenient location of program, transportation, childcare for siblings, homework tutoring, snack/meals for daughter | Mothers: Top 3 dance styles – Hip-hop, African, and Jazz  
Motivation for participation – pride in African-American culture, bonding time with mother  
Barriers – none stated  
Resources needed – homework tutoring |

PA=physical activity